

MINUTES

WORKSHOP MEETING

MARLBORO TOWNSHIP BOARD OF EDUCATION ADMINISTRATION BUILDING MARLBORO, NEW JERSEY 07746

NOVEMBER 20, 2018 - 7:00 P.M.

CALL TO ORDER Mrs. Robyn Wolfe, Board President, called the Workshop Meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT Robert Daniel, Dara Enny, Vlad Goldfarb, Randy Heller, Stephen Shifrinson, Susie Shrem, Robyn Wolfe and Ellen Xu (arrived at 7:23 p.m.).

MEMBERS ABSENT Anisha Gizersky

OTHERS PRESENT Mr. Michael Ballone, Mrs. Cindy S. Barr-Rague, Ms. Shannon Ferraro, Mr. Kevin P. Frenia, Holman, Frenia, Allison, P.C.; Mr. Sam Hendrickson, Dr. Eric Hibbs, Mrs. Judy Kramer, Ms. Lisa Lisnow, Mr. Brian Reiner, Mr. Mitch Shatz, Ms. Grace Shemtov, Mr. Thomas Slattery, Mrs. Christine Zappolo, Mr. Marc H. Zitomer, Esquire, Schenck, Price, Smith & King LLP and approximately 25 members of the student body, staff and the public.

SUNSHINE LAW

Be advised that this meeting is being held in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, Chapter 231 P.L. 1975 (Sunshine Law) and that adequate notice of the date, time and agenda has been sent to the Asbury Park Press and the News Transcript and has been posted and filed with the Marlboro Township Clerk. Copies have also been sent to each district school and other area newspapers in accordance with the law.

STATEMENT OF VIDEOTAPING OF PUBLIC PORTION OF BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETINGS

Please note that the public portion of all board of education meetings are videotaped and available for public viewing on our website. Therefore, members of the public should have no expectation of privacy in any statements that they make when addressing the Board/Administration.

PUBLIC COMMENT(S) STATEMENT

Pursuant to Board Policy 0164 and 0167 Roberts' Rules of Order shall govern the Board of Education in its deliberations and in the conduct of its meetings. As such, all comments from the public and from other members of the Board should be directed to the Board President who is responsible for presiding over the meeting. The President shall direct all inquiries or comments to the appropriate Administrator or Board member for response, after all members of the public have had an opportunity to speak. The Board/Administration may not have a response for all inquiries at the public meeting. In those circumstances, a response will be provided in a timely manner. Per Board Policy, if it appears that the public participation will exceed 60 minutes, the Board President may impose a set time limit per speaker at the beginning of the public participation portion of the meeting. Moreover,

the President may interrupt, warn, or terminate a participant's statement when the statement is too lengthy, abusive, obscene, or irrelevant. In addition, the President may request any individual to leave the meeting when that person does not observe reasonable decorum, whether the person is at the microphone or at any other place in the meeting room or building. New Jersey law prohibits any person from disrupting a public meeting. Law enforcement will be contacted if a person disrupts the meeting and fails to desist after being directed to do so by the Board President or Superintendent. Finally, out of respect, we ask that you refer to our administrators or staff members by their titles, such as Doctor, Mr. or Mrs. Thank you.

NO SMOKING ON SCHOOL GROUNDS

Please be advised that there is no smoking on school grounds – inside or outside – at any time.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE - Kindergartners Joseph Azzaretto, Trinity DeHoyos, Madison Fabbella, Olivia Fabbella, Cooper Ferland, Alexa Ferraro, Henry Garfield, Paige Kennedy, Travis Levin, Lilian Lin, Adian Osmanaj, Jacob Shrem, Paige Silacci, Siena Story, Joanna Tryniszewski and Matthew Zeleznik from Marlboro Elementary School led the Pledge of Allegiance.

STUDENT PRESENTATION - A group of kindergarten students from Marlboro Elementary School shared a song about Pilgrims coming to America, sailing on the Mayflower, making friends with the Native Americans, planting corn and having a feast.

Accompanied by Principal Mitch Shatz; Teachers Lisa Lisnow, Christine Zappolo and Judy Kramer, and Instructional Assistants Shannon Ferraro and Grace Shemtov, the following students joined the Board this evening:

From Ms. Lisnow's Class: Madison Fabbella, Paige Kennedy, Matthew Zeleznik, Henry Garfield, and Cooper Ferland

From Mrs. Zappolo's Class: Joanna Tryniszewski, Olivia Fabbella, Adian Osmanaj, Joseph Azzaretto and Lilian Lin

From Mrs. Kramer's Class: Trinity De Hoyos, Alexa Ferraro, Travis Levin, Jacob Shrem, Paige Silacci and Siena Story

Mrs. Robyn Wolfe, Board President, thanked the teachers, instructional aides and students from Marlboro Elementary School for joining the Board this evening.

RECESS

Mrs. Wolfe recessed the Workshop Meeting at 7:07 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER

Mrs. Wolfe called the Workshop Meeting to order at 7:12 p.m.

ANNOUNCEMENT(S)

There were no announcements.

MOMENT OF SILENCE

A Moment of Silence was observed for those affected by the tragic fire in Colts Neck and extended condolences to the family.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mrs. Wolfe shared a letter that she received from Mrs. Anisha Gizersky, Board Member, wherein regrettably, she resigned from the Board of Education. Mrs. Gizersky indicated that holding any elected public position is in direct conflict with the job responsibilities of her current role.

Mrs. Wolfe stated that the Board of Education is required to follow statute N.J.S.A. 18A:12-15 and that a full discussion of the process will be addressed under New Business.

Mrs. Wolfe stated that she and Dr. Randy Heller, Board Vice President, attended the district's 11th Annual Multicultural Day. The students from Marlboro Memorial and Marlboro Middle Schools performed different acts which represented 16 different cultures around the world. She further stated that Congressman Frank Pallone was in attendance as well as many members of the community.

Dr. Eric Hibbs, Superintendent of Schools, stated that, with regards to the day's tragedy, he personally contacted Dr. MaryJane Garibay, Superintendent, Colts Neck Township Schools and offered services through the Traumatic Loss Coalition of Monmouth County.

Dr. Hibbs stated that we are in the process of organizing a Freehold Regional Service Learning Project which will encompass approximately 40,000 students agreeing upon a pathway to better the world. He further outlined the process of this endeavor which will be an incredible journey for our students.

Dr. Hibbs stated that there will be participation in a comprehensive school-based Suicide Prevention and Response Program. He expressed the importance of everyone being trained in all emergencies that may arise in today's environment. Dr. Hibbs stated that Life Lines is a free program that was applied for and awarded to the district which includes three days of training, textbooks and handouts that will assist with suicide prevention and response.

Dr. Hibbs stated that Marlboro Middle; Marlboro Elementary and Robertsville Elementary Schools have received their Future Ready Certification. He further stated that the remaining schools will have information resubmitted due to an oversight in their original submission.

HARASSMENT/INTIMIDATION/ BULLYING (HIB) REPORT OCTOBER 11, 2018 - NOVEMBER 15, 2018 INCIDENTS 9

PUBLIC COMMENT(S)

Mrs. Bonnie Gabizon, 2 Harvest Court, Marlboro, New Jersey 07746 asked for an overview and answers to specific questions regarding AME Consulting. She stated that this is an educational consulting firm owned by Mr. Michael Ballone, Director of Curriculum and Instruction, who employs Dr. Eric Hibbs. She also asked for an explanation of the role of Dr. Bernard F. Bragen, former Superintendent of Schools in Hazlet, in this company.

Dr. Hibbs responded that the company, owned by Mr. Ballone, provides data analysis. He further stated that no data is used from students in Marlboro Township and related work is done on his own time; not district time, i.e. personal day, vacation time.

Dr. Hibbs stated that Dr. Bragen's involvement is a result of the retirement of the former Supervisor of Special Services, Mrs. Linda Attanasio, and the resignation of the former Director of Special Services, Ms. Jennifer Zona. These vacancies left the Special Services Department with no leadership. Dr. Bragen's background includes being a Director of a Child Study Team and he has a special education consulting firm. He is currently mentoring our current leadership, Dr. Dana Blair, Director of Special Services and Mrs. Maryelizabeth Tirone, Supervisor of Special Services.

Dr. Hibbs stated that there is absolutely no solicitation done at conferences; school districts have reached out to AME but no work is done on Marlboro time.

Mrs. Wolfe stated, "We should be honored that other districts are asking our Superintendent to present at other districts."

AGENDA:

REVIEW OF AGENDA

PRESENTATION OF THE 2017 - 2018 SCHOOL YEAR AUDIT

Mr. Kevin P. Frenia, Holman, Frenia, Allison, P.C., presented the 2017 – 2018 School Year Audit. He stated that there has been a delay in filing this year due to the Governmental Value Standards Board issuing new standards regarding reporting health benefits. He further stated that this is a draft form of the audit and cannot be approved until filed. The filing date has been moved to December 21, 2018 and pointed out that the financial information will not change.

Mr. Frenia presented highlights of this audit:

- 1) The Marlboro Township Public School District received the Certificate of Excellence;
- 2) The Independent Auditors' report resulted in an unmodified opinion which is the best opinion that you can receive;
- 3) The MD&A provides overall information on the district;
- 4) Budgetary Comparison;
- 5) Review of the fund balance which included a detailed breakdown; and
- 6) Financial trends over 10 years and supplemental information

Mr. Frenia stated that the Auditor's Management Report is from the auditors to the Board that provides an overview of what they do. He further stated that there were no comments and that everything was in order.

Mrs. Cindy S. Barr-Rague, School Business Administrator/Board Secretary, stated that not filing the audit at this point will not affect the QSAC (Quality Single Accountability Continuum) since the state has acknowledged that there is an issue.

REVIEW OF CURRICULUM GUIDES

- **VISUAL AND PERFORMING ARTS - DANCE, GRADES K-8**
- **VISUAL AND PERFORMING ARTS - THEATRE, GRADES K-8**

Mr. Ballone stated that a new requirement, in order to be in compliance with QSAC, is that these criteria be listed as separate documents. He further stated that these will still be in compliance with all criteria in the district's curriculum. These will be included on the November 27, 2018 Regular Meeting Agenda for approval.

Dr. Hibbs stated that these are not new curriculum; just listed separately in order to be in compliance with QSAC.

FINANCIAL AND BUSINESS OPERATIONS MATTERS

PERSONNEL MATTERS

OLD BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

PUBLIC COMMENT(S)

FINANCIAL AND BUSINESS OPERATIONS MATTERS

The Superintendent of Schools submitted the following resolution for approval:

1. HARASSMENT/INTIMIDATION/ BULLYING (HIB) REPORT

RESOLVED that the Marlboro Township Board of Education accepts the Superintendent's Action(s) for the following NJ Smart Number HIB Report as reported to the Board at its Board Meeting of October 16, 2018 for the period September 27, 2018 - October 10, 2018 wherein 1 incident was reported, but not a HIB incident.

NJ SMART NUMBER(S)
1. N/A

DISCUSSION:

There was no discussion.

ROLL CALL VOTE

FINANCIAL & BUSINESS OPERATIONS MATTERS	
MOVED BY	Randy Heller
SECONDED BY	Susie Shrem
AYE	Robert Daniel, Dara Enny, Vlad Goldfarb, Randy Heller, Stephen Shifrinson, Susie Shrem, Robyn Wolfe and Ellen Xu
NAY	None
ABSTAIN	None

PERSONNEL MATTERS

The Superintendent of Schools submitted the following resolutions for approval:

1. APPLICATION FOR DISABILITY RETIREMENT

RESOLVED, that the Board of Education grant a request by Robin Shoblock, Teacher of Language Arts, to apply for ordinary disability retirement effective January 1, 2019, pending a decision by the Division of Pensions and Benefits regarding her application for said disability retirement.

2. SUBSTITUTE TEACHER

RESOLVED, that the name of the following individual be added to the list of substitute teachers for the remainder of the 2018-2019 school year.

NAME	CERTIFICATION
Matthew Chretien*	Certificate of Eligibility with Advanced Standing - Elementary School Teacher in Grades K- 6 Certificate of Eligibility with Advanced Standing - Elementary School Teacher with Social Studies Specialization: in Grades 5-8

* Pending the results of the Criminal History Review.

3. AMENDED EXTRACURRICULAR ACTIVITIES ADVISOR

RESOLVED, that the following employee be approved as an extracurricular activities advisor for the 2018-2019 school year.

FROM				
NAME	LOCATION	ACTIVITY	LEVEL/ STEP	STIPEND
Brandon Russo	Marlboro Memorial Middle School	Wrestling (Grades 6 th - 8 th)	III/1	\$3,534.00

TO				
NAME	LOCATION	ACTIVITY	LEVEL / STEP	STIPEND
Matthew Chretien	Marlboro Memorial Middle School	Wrestling (Grades 6 th - 8 th)	III/1	\$3,534.00

DISCUSSION:

There was no discussion.

ROLL CALL VOTE

PERSONNEL MATTERS	
MOVED BY	Vlad Goldfarb
SECONDED BY	Stephen Shifrinson
AYE	Robert Daniel, Dara Enny, Vlad Goldfarb, Randy Heller, Stephen Shifrinson, Susie Shrem, Robyn Wolfe and Ellen Xu
NAY	None
ABSTAIN	None

OLD BUSINESS

Mrs. Dara Enny, Board Member, asked for the hourly rate of the bond counsel for the ESCO (Energy Service Company). Mrs. Barr-Rague responded that they have estimated the cost to be \$5,000.

Mrs. Enny asked if the Board approves going forward with the ESCO, will we receive those monies back since it was stated this would be at no cost. Mrs. Barr-Rague responded that this portion of the ESCO would not.

Mr. Vlad Goldfarb, Board Member, asked if the process could be completed without the bond counsel. Mrs. Barr-Rague replied that it is not recommended nor could she complete the process without counsel due to its complexity.

Mr. Daniel asked what other ESCO related costs would the district be responsible for if the project was terminated. Mrs. Barr-Rague replied that there would be no additional cost if the project was stopped. She further stated that contractors will be competing for business through the RFP (Request for Proposals) which includes guaranteeing the work and savings.

Dr. Hibbs stated that the district can only realize these additional savings by completing this process.

NEW BUSINESS

There was a discussion amongst the Board Members, Administration and the Board Attorney regarding the vacant board position as a result of Mrs. Gizersky's resignation. Mr. Marc H. Zitomer, Esquire, Schenck, Price, Smith & King, LLP, reviewed the Board Policy 0143 which addresses the process of filling this position.

Mrs. Barr-Rague outlined the timeline to be followed in this process:

- 1) Advertisement placed in the *Asbury Park Press* for this vacancy on December 2, 2018;
- 2) Advertisement placed in the *News Transcript* for this vacancy on December 5, 2018;
- 3) Vacancy will be posted on the district's website and in schools;
- 4) Instructions to submit resume and letter of interest to Mrs. Barr-Rague by December 11, 2018 no later than 12:00 noon; and
- 5) Board to interview candidate and appoint on December 18, 2018, if agreed upon.

ORGANIZATION MATTERS

1. RESIGNATION

RESOLVED, that the Board of Education hereby accepts the resignation of Mrs. Anisha Gizersky, effective immediately; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Board Secretary is hereby directed to advertise the vacancy and seek candidates for the position in accordance with Board Policy.

DISCUSSION:

There was no discussion.

ROLL CALL VOTE

ORGANIZATION MATTERS ADDENDUM # 1 – ITEM # 1- RESIGNATION	
MOVED BY	Robert Daniel
SECONDED BY	Vlad Goldfarb
AYE	Robert Daniel, Dara Enny, Vlad Goldfarb, Randy Heller, Stephen Shiffrinson, Susie Shrem, Robyn Wolfe and Ellen Xu
NAY	None
ABSTAIN	None

PUBLIC COMMENT(S)

Mrs. Bonnie Gabizon, 2 Harvest Court, Marlboro, New Jersey 07746 asked the Board for their opinion as to a conflict of interest in Mr. Ballone's educational consulting business; i.e. evaluations of staff by Dr. Hibbs, testing of students. She also questioned when the Board found out that these employees had a business.

Mrs. Wolfe responded that she found out when the information was posted and shared. She further stated that she sees no issue with this and that it is common place for superintendents to conduct presentations.

Mr. Zitomer responded that, from a legal standpoint, there is no conflict of interest. He further stated that Mr. Ballone's and Mr. Adam Lindstrom's employment terms are governed by a union contract. He further stated that there have been no promotions given to either employee by Dr. Hibbs.

Mr. Michael Mirken, 122 Bramble Drive, Morganville, New Jersey 07751 commented as follows:

- 1) A possible conflict of interest should be addressed in advance, rather than a reactive response;
- 2) Requested that a syllabus be given to students and parents in the beginning of the school year;
- 3) The Board of Education should recuse itself in appointing a new Board member since this is within 60 days of the last vote and the County Superintendent's Office should make the appointment.

Mr. Zitomer responded that the Board of Education is governed by a statute that requires the Board to make an appointment within 65 days. The County Superintendent would make this appointment if the Board fails to act within the timeline.

Dr. Hibbs thanked Mr. Mirken and stated that he would go back to his team to discuss the idea of providing a syllabus. Dr. Hibbs informed Mr. Mirken that the curriculum guides are online and give related information on each course as well as Genesis providing passwords for the online programs.

Mrs. Enny stated that past precedents are something to look at with regards to filling the vacant position.

Mrs. Wolfe stated that the same process was used for filling the position regarding Mr. Joseph Waldman and Mrs. Debbie Mattos.

Mr. Zitomer stated that deliberations regarding a candidate's qualifications would be discussed in Executive Session.

Mrs. Bonnie Gabizon, 2 Harvest Court, Marlboro, New Jersey 07746 asked if Mr. Zitomer represented the Board of Education and how did Dr. Hibbs know that his business relationship did not present a legal conflict. Mr. Zitomer responded that he did represent the Board of Education and Dr. Hibbs responded that he consulted his own attorney with regards to this matter.

Mr. Angelo DelGiudice, 2 Old Scots Road, Marlboro, New Jersey 07746 stated that the Referendums have failed although there are concerns with the needs in our schools. Mr. DelGiudice asked what can be done to accomplish resolving these concerns and embrace the support of the community.

Dr. Hibbs responded that the ESCO is the first step in this process. He further stated that there is approximately \$6 million between the Maintenance Reserve and Capital Reserve accounts which can be used towards some of these projects. Dr. Hibbs offered the possibility of doing smaller projects and using the ESCO to accomplish some of them. However, he stated that not all repairs will be addressed using these processes.

Mrs. Wolfe thanked Mr. DelGiudice for his comments.

Mr. Daniel stated that there was an independent facilities audit completed to confirm the needs outlined in the district's audit. The members of the community had requested this independent audit.

Mr. Angelo DelGiudice, 2 Old Scots Road, Marlboro, New Jersey 07746 stated that he is on the Board of the Society for Prevention of Teen Suicide and offered to provide information on this issue.

EXECUTIVE SESSION RESOLUTION

RESOLVED that in accordance with the provisions of the Open Public Meetings Act ("Act"), the Marlboro Township Board of Education shall conduct a closed executive session pursuant to the Personnel and Legal exception(s) prescribed by N.J.S.A. 10:4-12 for the purpose of discussing:

- (1) Matter(s) of Attorney/Client Privilege

It is anticipated that the length of time of this executive session will be 15 minutes and that action will not be taken in public after the executive session.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the minutes of the executive session will be released when the need for confidentiality in accordance with N.J.S.A. 10:4-12 no longer applies.

DISCUSSION:

There was no discussion.

ROLL CALL VOTE

EXECUTIVE SESSION RESOLUTION	
MOVED BY	Randy Heller
SECONDED BY	Susie Shrem
AYE	Robert Daniel, Dara Enny, Vlad Goldfarb, Randy Heller, Stephen Shifrinson, Susie Shrem, Robyn Wolfe and Ellen Xu
NAY	None
ABSTAIN	None

ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Randy Heller and seconded by Susie Shrem, the Workshop Meeting adjourned to Executive Session at 8:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Cindy S. Barr-Rague
School Business Administrator/Board Secretary