

Hampden-Wilbraham Regional School District

M. Martin O'Shea
Superintendent
moshea@hwrsd.org



621 Main Street
Wilbraham, MA 01095
Phone: (413)596-3884
FAX: (413)599-1328

HWRSD Middle School Renovations and/or Consolidation: Costs and Implications **Key Findings of the JLS Architect Middle School Report, August 2015**

In the spring of 2015, the HWRSD School Committee, at the urging of the Middle School Task Force commissioned JLS Architects to perform an architectural and engineering study to explore the feasibility and potential costs associated with developing a single regional middle school using modular construction at the Thornton Burgess site and the Wilbraham Middle School site. This study also was designed to explore existing conditions at each school in order to assess the long term viability of each site. The complete 60 page report along with a 22-slide public power point presentation of the study's findings will be posted to www.hwrsd.org. This document summarizes the key findings of the JLS report. It should be noted that this report is informational and not directional.

Chart A: Estimate of Probable Costs (see attached)

Chart A represents JLS Architects' estimate of probable costs associated with renovating and/or consolidating at the Thornton Burgess site or Wilbraham Middle site.

Column One on *Chart A*, renovation, indicates the costs associated with addressing the deficiencies of the buildings envelopes (walls, windows, roof and doors), the buildings interiors (interior walls, ceilings, doors, floors, kitchen) and the buildings mechanical and electrical systems (Fire Protection, Plumbing, Mechanical, Electrical And Technology). The renovation work would extend the useful life of each building and bring each system and component up to current code, but would not change the footprints/floorplans or produce the sort of educational and architectural designs associated with a 21st century learning environment. Additionally, it should be stressed that, given the District's enrollment trends, it is highly unlikely that the Massachusetts School Building Authority (MSBA) would participate in the renovation of two HWRSD middle schools. In other words, the renovation work, which will come due at some point, will most likely be a local endeavor not supported by the MSBA.

Column Two on *Chart A* shows an estimate of the costs of renovating and adding enough space via traditional construction at each building to accommodate over 700 students (an additional 40,000 square feet at TWB and 6,000 sq. ft at WMS). It is important to note that an addition cannot happen at either building without an overall renovation, because the addition would trigger requirements that each building component be brought up to current code.

Column Three on *Chart A* relates to the feasibility of consolidating at either middle school through the use of temporary, modular construction. It demonstrates the conclusion of JLS Architects that TWB is not a feasible site for temporary modular space. There are several reasons for this. First, TWB's core spaces (Kitchen/Cafeteria, Auditorium, Gymnasium/Lockers, Library), are not large enough to handle over 700 students. Second, most of TWB building components (septic system, well-water, electrical, etc.) do not have the capacity to serve such a significant increase in occupancy. These spaces and systems would have to be completely replaced or expanded to handle 700 students which, in turn would trigger code requirements requiring a complete renovation. Third, the resulting footprint of the consolidated middle school at the TWB site, would significantly reduce, if not eliminate, existing grassed areas available for playfields.

JLS Architects concluded that WMS is a feasible site to combine using modular construction and that, with the exception of utility connections, modular classrooms could be installed with no requirement to renovate or improve the existing building. The core spaces and existing building components at WMS could handle the increased occupancy that would result from a consolidation. Chart B shows the costs associated with leasing or purchasing modularly constructed space.

Chart B: Modular Addition Cost Comparison (see attached)

Chart B shows lease or purchase options associated with three different modular classroom options. The purchase option is typically pursued when districts need the additional space for more than five years. The District has previously estimated that if consolidation occurred at the middle school level that it would need additional space at Wilbraham Middle only through the 2018-2019 school year. The column showing the total cost shows the total outlay, including delivery and installation, over a two or three year period. The District has previously indicated that the costs of modular space could be covered by the \$675,000 to \$1.2 million in *annual* savings that could be achieved with the closure of one of middle school.

Chart A

ESTIMATE OF PROBABLE COSTS – SUMMARY

	RENOVATION	RENOVATION AND ADD ON FOR CONSOLIDATION – TRADITIONAL CONSTRUCTION	MODULAR CONSTRUCTION ADDITION
TWB	\$ 9,546,000	\$ 26, 701,000	NOT FEASIBLE
WMS	\$10,429,650	\$ 16,748, 900	SEE SEPARATE CHART

WILBRAHAM MIDDLE SCHOOL

MODULAR ADDITION COST COMPARISON *

OWNERSHIP VS. LEASE

FOUR MODULAR CLASSROOMS

4,200 SQ. FT. GROSS

Cost B

OPTION	PURCHASE OPTION NOTE (1)	LEASE OPTIONS 24 MONTH LEASE (BUILDING ONLY) NOTE (2)	LEASE OPTION 36 MONTH LEASE (BUILDING ONLY) NOTE (2)	TOTAL COST 24 MO./36 MO. LEASE (INCLUDES DELIVERY, INSTALLATION AND UTILITY CONNECTIONS NOTE (3))	END OF LEASE RESALE VALUE
OPTION NO. 1 WOOD CONSTRUCTION PLYWOOD SIDING	\$862,000.00	\$8,120.00/MO. TOT: \$194,880.00	\$6,370.00/MO. TOT: \$229,320.00	TOT: \$585,880.00/ \$620,320.00	\$250,000.00
OPTION NO. 2 PREMIUM WOOD CONSTRUCTION CEMENT BOARD SIDING	\$932,000.00	\$8,760.00/MO. TOT: \$210,240.00	\$6,900.00/MO. TOT: \$248,400.00	TOT: \$601,240.00/ \$639,400.00	\$250,000.00
OPTION NO. 3 STEEL CONSTRUCTION CONCRETE FLOOR 1/2 IN. BRICK VENEER	\$1,034,000.00	\$9,720.00/MO. TOT: \$233,280.00	\$7,650.00/MO. TOT: \$275,400.00	TOT: \$702,280.00/ \$744,400.00	\$275,000.00

NOTE (1) : COST INCLUDES FABRICATION, DELIVERY, INSTALLATION, UTILITY CONNECTIONS AND SIDEWALK CANOPY.
COST OF FURNISHINGS AND EQUIPMENT NOT INCLUDED.

NOTE (2) : COST DOES NOT INCLUDE FABRICATION, DELIVERY, INSTALLATION, UTILITY CONNECTIONS OR
FURNISHINGS AND EQUIPMENT.

NOTE (3) : COST INCLUDES SIDEWALK CANOPY BETWEEN MODULARS AND EXISTING CLASSROOM WING.

* THE INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN SHALL BE CONSIDERED AN "OPINION OF PROBABLE CONSTRUCTION COST"
PENDING FINAL DETERMINATION OF SCOPE OF WORK AND SCHEDULE.